

28. Application of Codicology Science in Ottoman Manuscripts¹

Yasin ŐEŐEN²

APA: Őeřen, Y. (2024). Application of Codicology Science in Ottoman Manuscripts. *RumeliDE Dil ve Edebiyat Arařtırmaları Dergisi*, (41), 569-588. DOI: <https://zenodo.org/record/13337733>

Abstract

Manuscripts are valuable and unique works distinguished by their physical content and quality. Specially trained and specialized information and document managers are needed to deliver these works to users because their content characteristics may not be compatible with previous works. Some manuscripts may also cover very important and special topics from their period. In order to evaluate these manuscripts, the number of works in the collection, their subjects, contents, page structure, the period the page belongs to, the important periods in which it was written, etc. information must be determined exactly. However, in some cases, it may be difficult to determine the material, spiritual, scientific, cultural and artistic values carried by the works. Because in some manuscripts, the author concealed himself, used uncertain pseudonyms and/or did not specify his author information at all. Today, information about manuscript content is obtained by scanning old works and sometimes old indexes that contain information such as the author's name, the title of the work, and the content information of the work. In this respect, it is quite difficult to determine the content information of manuscripts, therefore special methods such as 'codicology science' should be applied to characterize them. The study focused on how the science of codicology can be applied and how the applied studies can contribute to the science of information and document management. The application of the science of codicology to manuscripts and rare works can have a positive effect on the development of librarianship and historical research and future proposals.

Keywords: cultural heritage, codicology, manuscripts, Ottoman Empire.

¹ **Statement (Thesis / Paper):** It is declared that scientific and ethical principles were followed during the preparation process of this study and all the studies utilised are indicated in the bibliography.

Conflict of Interest: No conflict of interest is declared.

Funding: No external funding was used to support this research.

Copyright & Licence: The authors own the copyright of their work published in the journal and their work is published under the CC BY-NC 4.0 licence.

Source: It is declared that scientific and ethical principles were followed during the preparation of this study and all the studies used are stated in the bibliography.

Similarity Report: Received - Turnitin, Rate: 2

Ethics Complaint: editor@rumelide.com

Article Type: Research article, **Article Registration Date:** 27.06.2024-**Acceptance Date:** 20.08.2024-

Publication Date: 21.08.2024; DOI: <https://zenodo.org/record/13337733>

Peer Review: Two External Referees / Double Blind

² Dr .Öđr. Gör., Niđe Ömer Halisdemir Üniversitesi, Rektörlük / Dr. Lecturer, Nigde Omer Halisdemir University, Rectorate (Niđe, Türkiye), ysesen11@gmail.com, **ORCID ID:** <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6896-0567> **ROR ID:** <https://ror.org/03ejnre35> **ISNI:** 0000 0001 0700 8038, **Crossreff Funder ID:** 501100010625

Osmanlı El Yazmalarında Kodikoloji Biliminin Uygulanması³

Öz

El yazmaları, fiziksel içerikleri ve kaliteleriyle ayırt edilen değerli ve benzersiz eserlerdir. Bu eserleri kullanıcılara ulaştırmak için özel olarak eğitilmiş ve bu konuda uzmanlaşmış bilgi ve belge yöneticilerine ihtiyaç vardır çünkü içerik özellikleri önceki eserlerle uyumlu olmayabilir. Bazı el yazmaları dönemindeki çok önemli ve özel konuları da kapsayabilir. Bu el yazmalarını değerlendirmek için koleksiyondaki eser sayısı, konuları, içerikleri, sayfa yapısı, sayfanın ait olduğu dönemin hangi dönem olduğu, hangi önemli dönemlerde kaleme alındığı vb. bilgilerin tam olarak belirlenmesi gerekmektedir. Ancak bazı durumlarda eserlerin taşıdığı maddi, manevi, bilimsel, kültürel ve sanatsal değerleri belirlemek zor olabilir. Çünkü bazı el yazması eserlerde, yazar kendisini gizlemiş, belirsiz mahlaslar kullanmış ve/veya yazar bilgilerini hiç belirtmemiştir. Günümüzde el yazması içerikleri hakkında bilgi, yazar adı, eser adı, eserin içerik bilgileri gibi bilgileri içeren eski eserler ve bazen eski dizinler taranarak elde edilmektedir. El yazmalarının içerik bilgilerini belirlemek bu açıdan oldukça zordur, bu nedenle bunları karakterize etmek için 'kodikoloji bilimi' gibi özel yöntemler uygulanmalıdır. Çalışmada, kodikoloji biliminin nasıl uygulanabileceği ve uygulanan çalışmaların da bilgi ve belge yönetimi bilimine nasıl katkı sağlayabileceği üzerinde durulmuştur. Kodikoloji biliminin el yazmalarına ve nadir eserlere uygulanması, kütüphaneciliğin ve tarihsel araştırmaların gelişimi ve gelecekteki öneriler üzerinde olumlu bir etkiye sahip olabilir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: kültürel miras, kodikoloji, el yazmaları, Osmanlı İmparatorluğu..

³ **Beyan (Tez/ Bildiri):** Bu çalışmanın hazırlanma sürecinde bilimsel ve etik ilkelere uyulduğu ve yararlanılan tüm çalışmaların kaynakçada belirtildiği beyan olunur.

Çıkar Çatışması: Çıkar çatışması beyan edilmemiştir.

Finansman: Bu araştırmayı desteklemek için dış fon kullanılmamıştır.

Telif Hakkı & Lisans: Yazarlar dergide yayınlanan çalışmalarının telif hakkına sahiptirler ve çalışmalarını CC BY-NC 4.0 lisansı altında yayımlanmaktadır.

Kaynak: Bu çalışmanın hazırlanma sürecinde bilimsel ve etik ilkelere uyulduğu ve yararlanılan tüm çalışmaların kaynakçada belirtildiği beyan olunur.

Benzerlik Raporu: Alındı – Turnitin, Oran: %2

Etik Şikayeti: editor@rumelide.com

Makale Türü: Araştırma makalesi, **Makale Kayıt Tarihi:** 27.06.2024-**Kabul Tarihi:** 20.08.2024-**Yayın Tarihi:** 21.08.2024; **DOI:** <https://zenodo.org/record/13337733>

Hakem Değerlendirmesi: İki Dış Hakem / Çift Taraflı Körleme

1. Introduction

Manuscripts are a valuable part of a society's heritage, preserved from the past to the present. Cultural heritage products play a vital role in preserving a society's culture for future generations. They are a collective representation of human creation throughout the history of civilization. In addition, materials that hold future value and, in some cases, are specially selected and protected, may also be considered part of cultural heritage. The concept of cultural heritage is a broad and interpretative issue used by archivists, historians, sociologists, archaeologists, museum researchers, and other information professionals. Over time, it continues to remain a significant topic. Studies on manuscripts have consistently remained an important area of interest and have survived to this day.

Just as archaeological findings are one of the most important research topics for researchers researching cultural heritage, the information obtained from manuscripts is also important for both historians and sociologists. While manuscripts represent the civilization to which they belong as the common history of humanity, they also have universal value as complementary parts of the common accumulation of all humanity. "Manuscripts, which are the products of the original literature of the cultural heritage spectrum, are an accumulation or collection and an old relic that introduces us to the codes of the past in the best way" (Rukancı, 2018, p. 1). As Rukancı pointed out, while humanity looks to the past through manuscripts, it also carries its historical accumulation from the past to the present.

Codicology studies, allow researchers to examine artifacts, especially manuscripts written on parchment or paper in codex form, as physical objects. Each medieval manuscript is a separate book, and codicological studies allow researchers to discover information about the book's context of production and use as well as historical traditions that are not necessarily contained within the content. The examination of books from a codicological standpoint involves using various methods from different academic fields (Haltrich et al., 2017, p. 5).

There are comments from various researchers and academicians on the definition of the term codicology. These comments can be addressed as follows: Codicology is the science of determining the historical and cultural value of a work by analyzing the physical structure and characteristic features of manuscripts (Reitz, 2024, p. 12). In the Western world, 'codex + logy = codicology,' the science of work is very important in terms of defining all the manuscript collections we have today (Rukancı, 2015, p. 4). Codicology or paleography, which studies the history of manuscripts, is a special branch of science. Paleography includes all known writing and writing methods. Paleography of inscriptions, paleography of texts written on cylinders and tablets, paleography of documents written on papyrus rolls and leaves, etc. However, the current general use of assigning paleography only to examine manuscripts in libraries and documents in archives, links the concept of paleography to the analysis of manuscript books and manuscript documents ("Codicology and Paleography", 2024).

Günay Kut, an important archivist, has noted that codicology science encompasses the examination of many types of works. These include miniature works, illuminated works, calligraphy works, pieces by renowned calligraphers, works found only in our archives worldwide, and those dating back to ancient times. Traces of Turkish writings from the Ottoman period can be traced back to 600 years ago. In Arabic and Persian works, this regression dates back to the early periods of Islam. The primary objective of manuscript catalogs is to promote the use of works in a collection or library, thereby ensuring their complete preservation and availability for researchers. "Identifying the work is a matter of expertise in every aspect. It seems that the West has recently called this specialty 'codicology' and those who do this

job ‘codicologists’. In this respect, introducing our manuscripts to our scientists, young researchers, and therefore to the world literature should be a priority” (Kut, 1999, pp. 78-82). As Kut stated, any academic study carried out on the manuscripts will improve the manuscripts and increase their recognition in the world.

Studying ancient manuscripts and analyzing their contents can be quite a laborious task. Some manuscripts are not in a condition to undergo these processes due to their physical state. Even when the physical condition of the manuscript is good, there may be incomplete or no information about the authors. This is particularly common in Turkish, Arabic, Persian, Latin, and other similar works. In the Turkish-Islamic civilization, determining the individuals involved in creating a book, both in terms of content and art, which they often kept secret, is a challenging task that requires expertise and experience (Rukancı, 2015, p. 4). These situations are the primary reason for the low number of practitioners and academics working in this field in our country.

There is a growing interest in the study of 'codicology' in our country, which aims to address these challenges. In many of his works (2015, 2016, 2018), Mr. Rukancı made detailed explanations about the necessity of the science of codicology and how it should be applied. The number of manuscript experts who can examine the estimated 500,000 manuscripts in our country is inversely proportional to the number of books. The manuscript catalogs that have been prepared so far have been valuable in terms of recording and listing manuscripts. However, there are differences and deficiencies between the catalogs. These studies have been carried out within the scope of various projects with non-professional personnel lacking a certain standard. As a result, researchers have not been able to benefit from the manuscripts at the desired level. “It is seen that written or manuscript copies are works that information and document managers often have difficulty in bibliographic qualification and require more time, experience, knowledge, and expertise compared to printed works” (Rukancı, 2015, p. 4; 2016, p. 17). As Rukancı mentioned, to support academic studies, it is important to create manuscript catalogs and ensure the continuity of their functionality. Ignoring the creation of catalogs or not focusing on them in detail is a mistake. There are examples from around the world that show ignoring catalogs is the wrong perspective. “For example, even in the United States in the 1970’s, some researchers found the automation of archive and library services unnecessary, comparing automation to renting a Boeing 747 to deliver bonbons to the other city” (Mason, 1971, p. 183). With today’s advancements, all of these outdated perspectives and meaningless views have become irrelevant.

Within the scope of codicology activities, it is possible to access the following detailed information about manuscripts:

- Age, period,
- The culture and civilization it belongs to,
- Production (structural) materials,
- Artistic value,
- Material value,
- Spiritual value,

- Descriptive information about originality and originality can be determined (Rukancı, 2018, p. 11).

Based on this detailed information, codicology is considered a strategic method and branch of science that should be used for the correct characterization, presentation, promotion, development, and dissemination of manuscripts.



Figure 1. A Manuscript Sample from the Archive of Teymour Mourad Morel (“Manuscript Example”, 2024)

The example of a manuscript from the Archive of Teymour Mourad Morel shows that information which can contribute to other manuscripts can be accessed from the content information of a manuscript. Teymour Mourad Morel makes the following statement on this subject: All studies conducted to introduce manuscript works enhance the accumulation of philosophical knowledge and the content of other works. “For example, the book written by Hocazade Muslihiddin, which is registered under number 779 in the Suleymaniye Manuscript Library Damat Ibrahim Pasha collection, a note found at the end of the manuscript titled Tehafütü'l-Felasife, which was taken and copied by Şeyhülislam Sa'di Çelebi, contains very important information in terms of the history of philosophy. In this note, Ibn Rushd's Commentary on Aristotle's work De Caelo. There is important information about the lost 3rd. the volume of the commentary titled Şerhu's-Sema and ve'l-Alem” (“Manuscript Example”, 2024). This information, which contains fragments from a lost manuscript, contributes to research on the history of philosophy.

2. General Literature About the Science of Codicology

In recent years, there has been a growing interest in technical, academic, and applied studies on manuscripts and rare works in Turkey and worldwide. These studies have led to increased reading and research on manuscripts, as well as a greater desire for research in literature, sociology, and other applied fields. To contribute to the existing literature, this article will discuss some important studies from SSCI, Scopus, and Tr-Dizin sources from around the world. These studies have been thoroughly read, analyzed, and included in the article with the author's own comments and inferences.

In his study, Uhlir discusses the contextual and practical differences between paper manuscripts and digital manuscripts. According to the traditional codicological concept, manuscripts can be analyzed based on the fundamental concepts of pure text and work. However, digital manuscripts have distinct features compared to previous handwritten manuscripts. Digital manuscripts can be continuously updated and maintained, making them technologically dynamic artifacts. Detailed content in digital

codicology is more comprehensive than it may seem at first. For instance, in the future, digital codicology studies will likely be used to analyze the true origin of many anonymous posts on the internet more effectively. As a result, people will likely be more cautious about writing anonymously on the internet. The aforementioned situations demonstrate that codicological studies make a positive contribution to written texts in every aspect. Additionally, it is evident that codicology has the potential for further advancement in the future. The work in this field will continue in the coming years (Uhlir, 2009, p. 10).

In his study, Okuyucu (2024, pp. 443-445) claims that manuscripts can be used to determine their periods and countries of origin by examining them in different environments. Codicology is the science that studies manuscripts as concrete data. It is seen as a branch of science that examines writing in many aspects such as paper making, ink, binding, binding and book cover, fascicle and fascicle sewing, page typesetting and illumination, ta'lik and annotation, and buying and selling of paper. Therefore, while the internal elements of the text are research works; external elements of the text fall within the scope of codicology. Codicology studies can be conducted on various Seljuk, Mamluk, and Ottoman manuscripts. However, distinct bindings and styles were utilized across different regions and time periods. For instance, Seljuk and Mamluk bindings are adorned with multi-armed and intertwined stars. In the Ottoman Empire, bindings became plain and salbek. Likewise, before Mehmet the Conqueror (1432-1481), the dominant color of coloring pages was blue; with the strengthening of the state, the golden color became dominant. In addition to all of these points, an advanced expert on manuscripts asserts that despite these changes, their understanding of handwriting cannot be constrained. A proficient writing expert should have no difficulty in identifying the time period and author of a work based on its ink, style, and writing characteristics. For instance, the Turkologist Birnbaum was able to determine the precise age of a manuscript solely based on its watermark. As a result, someone who is an expert on the subject, based on the binding, writing, and other physical characteristics of the work in hand; can access all information about that work. In this respect, the use of codicology in manuscripts is very important.

In his 2017 study, Del Barco (2017, pp. 3-27) focused on the codicological examination of Hebrew manuscripts. He discussed two manuscript samples with incomplete author information. The examination revealed that while codicological studies are related to paleography, the two sciences have distinct factors. Del Barco conducted a methodological analysis study on the two manuscripts, using a comparative-structural analysis method. The analysis showed that the two manuscripts did not consist of a single 'intact codicological unit/composite codex,' and demonstrated that this method could be a powerful tool for historical and textual research. Furthermore, it appears that this approach can also be applied to manuscripts containing multiple codices contributed by different authors or craftsmen. Additionally, it is possible to derive the codicological and textual parameters of Hebrew manuscripts produced in the late Middle Ages. The author also suggests that by utilizing the technical parameters discussed in the article, creating catalogs of all Hebrew manuscripts can be facilitated, and a structural or syntactic analysis of the codex works can be readily presented. As a result, many Hebrew manuscripts that are at risk of being lost to history can be studied in more detail, enabling the determination of author-subject information. This may also lead to swifter establishment of connections between works that were previously unattainable.

Dorofeeva (2019, p. 335-355) argues in her work that codicology applications are increasingly valuable in the field of digital manuscript studies, providing schematic visualizations of the compilation of Medieval manuscripts. This article proposes the construction of the collation map, a new type of diagram, as a digital tool to represent the material structure and content of complex Medieval

manuscripts. The article explains the features and advantages of the blending map compared to formulas. The author examined seven formulas proposed in different European countries. The goal of this examination was to compare and analyze the manuscripts. Text collation is done in conjunction with examining the manuscript's stratigraphy. Additionally, each method applied also decrypts certain passwords. The collation map does not contain all possible information about the physical manuscript and its contents; nor does it visualize the annotation layers with various damages and different types of margins on the parchment sheets. It is worth noting that revealing such information can provide evidence that contributes to the interpretation of the complex manuscript structures' stratigraphy. For instance, in the case of visualizing parchment leaves in Medieval manuscripts, it is essential to utilize schematic diagrams of individual pages. Furthermore, the tool provides an accessible way to combine essential codicological and textual information (structure and content) about a manuscript. This combined information can then be used as a visual and reference basis for a complete study. In an increasingly digital and global environment, visual representation and compatibility with national systems make significant contributions to science. The collation map is a practical tool that allows users to compare information typically found in separate catalog descriptions. By using this tool, we can uncover details about how each manuscript was made, where it came from, its internal textual connections, and other intricate information. Codicological studies allow us to comprehend a manuscript as a cohesive entity.

Related book study ("Handbook of Oriental Studies", 2019, pp. 38, 58, 308-310), it contains comprehensive guidance on the application of codicology in manuscripts. While the editors who prepared the book were examining the manuscript at the Cambridge University Library, they found a piece of paper that had fallen out of the manuscript. It is understood that this paper was first produced as a written text, and then the written text on this paper was digitally transferred to the computer environment. However, its primary use is for freehand doodling, essentially making the work a manuscript. The various formats of this article create a notable distinction between the print and digital worlds. The researcher may choose to put these distinctions into practice. In the world of manuscript and print, it is possible to track changes between the manuscript, print and digital worlds, respectively, to highlight the differences between the print and digital worlds. When it comes to manuscripts, printed copies are usually unique, making it hard to find another manuscript with the same text. On the other hand, digital manuscripts can be easily replicated and distributed to multiple users. This is important for sharing articles with different people. Again, as a printed work, the Prophet of Muslims gave the holy book 'Quran' that came to H.z. Muhammad can be discussed. Based on the 'Quran', which was produced from the information obtained from the revelations received by Muhammad and is considered the last religious book, it may be important from time to time to continue codicology studies on written manuscripts. One could go further and argue that the written Quran makes Islam more of a manuscript civilization than any other. The potential of Islam to heal the world is closely linked to manuscript culture. It's surprising that Muslims have been slow to accept and adopt printing technology. Even more surprising is the lack of fully trained experts in codicology despite the many manuscripts in Turkey. As a result, Turkish manuscripts are popular not only because they are valuable and excellent, but also because they have been digitized and cataloged in a usable form. It is important to continue studying these works. Additionally, digitalization will make these manuscripts more accessible internationally, leading to a greater understanding of religions if we support this shift.

In his article, Bekirođlu (2019, p. 859-890) mainly focuses on the standardization of the analysis methods of manuscripts. It seems that manuscript authentication, which began years ago in Western countries, is now moving toward standardization. However, it appears that no standard has been

reached in our country yet. Although different academic studies are carried out on the authentication of manuscripts in our country; there appears to be no current situation for editing drafts in a standard format. The selection of the appropriate copy for editing articles, the accessibility of all versions of the article, and the priority order of the accessed copies will evolve over time. It is evident that his expertise in this area will grow over time. If there is a development in the field of manuscript authentication, it appears that there is an underlying codicological development. These advancements progress in parallel in two areas. Important research is ongoing at the Islamic Research Center (ISAM) to verify manuscripts, with the aim of continuing studies using a common language and procedure. The purpose of this article is to promote the application of a specific method. It discusses practical steps to be taken for manuscript verification details. This article can help researchers select areas of study within this field. It is hoped that this article will generate interest in future studies on manuscript verification, leading to further development in codicological research. The study of codicology, now known as the science of manuscripts, has led to significant advancements in critical editing. The restoration of manuscripts and their availability for digital access have also contributed to this progress. As a result, researchers from various countries are now able to collaborate more easily. On the other hand, original author copies of some works previously thought to have no author copies were also found. It is worth considering that this situation may lead to potential differences in data between previously validated and published studies in the future. Therefore, it is important to continue efficient codicology studies in order to address these developments in more detail.

In Mr. Quick's (2020, pp. 38-50) article, it appears that he aimed to conduct a detailed examination of the manuscripts from ancient Jewish, Arab, and Babylonian civilizations. Initially, his focus was on the Aramaic manuscripts discovered in the Dead Sea. Quick's work is fundamentally centered around the codicological analysis of manuscripts from all Mesopotamian civilizations.

However, these efforts were attempted to be prevented for various reasons. It is thought that the basis of this obstruction lies in the strict perspective of the Jewish diaspora and the Christian world towards the Bible. It is argued that these incorrect perspectives will have a negative impact on the examination of works produced in the Persian and Hellenistic periods. There is also uncertainty about how to evaluate the relationship between the literature of elite and non-elite societies during this period. Quick's perspective on codicology aims to establish a connection between the Jewish Qumran finds and the more well-documented Greek-Roman tradition preserved in the Greco-Roman work Oxyrhynchus. In academic codicology studies, we can see that the evidence of the Qumran manuscripts has been thoroughly examined, leading to a deeper understanding of the social structure of that time. By focusing on specific study questions, we can analyze the codicological evidence more efficiently. One key area of focus is the relationship between scientific and non-scientific Aramaic texts and the respective authors who wrote them. Fundamentally, the differences and similarities between the manuscripts produced in the Judeo-Aramaic-Hellenistic period are a matter of debate. Although these observations are built on codicological considerations, it is also argued that all Aramaic texts from Qumran should be viewed as a separate group within the Qumran Library, with common patterns of language, style, and content. In Aramaic manuscripts, both scholarly commentaries on apocalyptic traditions and non-scholarly court narratives argue for the continuity of manuscripts in ancient Judaism through two ancient genres. The manuscripts of the Eastern Kingdoms were mainly about ancient apocalyptic stories and daily events. It's important to re-evaluate works of Eastern origin and their connections to the broader literary traditions of the ancient Near East. All existing manuscripts show that the elite context of both Greek novels and Jewish court stories is important, so scholars should be careful when attributing a popular or widespread readership to print media in the Ancient World.

In his recent article, Miroshnikov (2022, p. 90-104) examines a section of a two-part manuscript, specifically focusing on a three-leaf fragmentary parchment codex housed in the P. Morgan Lib, which is part of the Morgan Library Museum in New York. The article discusses the history and text of the Coptic Bible, as well as the codicology of this manuscript. It also delves into the physical contents of the article. The original page size of P. Morgan Lib can be measured at approximately 265. The original top and bottom side headings of the text are 320 mm. and 287 mm.; right and left margins are 253 mm. etc. is 234 mm. It is estimated that some manipulations and page theft were made on the pages of the work. Codicological studies are mostly followed through these lost pages. In the work where the physical characteristics of the manuscript are given in greater detail, Miroshnikov stated that he could compare the 265-page work in P. Morgan Lib with three other manuscripts in the Chester Beatty Library in Dublin and the Jeremias Monastery in Saqqara. The usefulness of codicology studies has also been demonstrated in this regard. In some cases, it is useful to carefully consider the technical information and content page details of manuscripts.

In this article (Karomani et al., 2022, pp. 76-82), manuscripts of the most famous works of Hz. Muhammad before and after were discussed in the context of Islamic literature. The manuscripts were analyzed with Islamic references. The author suggests that the codicology method, which can be seen as the archeology of the book, can be applied in this context. Some manuscripts contain important religious content dating back to before the time of Prophet Muhammad. The codicology method can be used to analyze many manuscripts from the pre-Muhammad era. The article's research method involves tracing the changes in historical events over time. As part of this research, the study examined religious symbols in the history of Islamic literature. The authors aim to uncover new information by tracing the history of religious literature. Additionally, connections between culture and religious literature are established by examining examples from Islamic mysteries. The symbolism and explanation of codes and elements in works of art were examined from a codicological perspective. After conducting the study, it is evident that the information obtained through codicology has had a significant impact on the study of Islamic literature and the development of art. Codicology is the study of manuscripts as physical objects on parchment or paper, often referred to as the "archeology of books". It involves the examination of materials and techniques used in creating books. By analyzing the physical properties of a book, we can trace its history, determine its origin, and compare it with other works to understand changes that have occurred over time. Paleographers and codicologists may also study the history of libraries, manuscripts, and book cataloguing. Codicology is therefore the 'archeology of the manuscript' or, more broadly, the 'archeology of the book'. In this article, H.z. Muhammad's uncle and known as the 'Lion of Islam' is to Hamza's life is discussed. The method of the research is to follow the H.z. Hamza story using codicological analysis based on its place in the Sırr-ı Sıdır copy. This research focuses on the old part of Hamza (Safa 1946), which has an important place in Islamic history and is included in the secrets of stories. This research also aims to reveal the Islamic mystery surrounding the inclusion of the story of Hamza within the Religious Mysteries and its position relative to other Islamic epic stories within the Religious Mysteries.

In their article, Mr. Tozun and Gedik (2023, pp. 538-550) conducted a codicological examination to discuss the methods for preserving and ensuring the continuity of manuscripts. They practically examined a manuscript entitled 'Kitâbu'l-İlel ve Ma'rifeti'r-ricâl', numbered 03380, at the Süleymaniye Manuscript Library-Hagia Sophia Collection.. Photographs and a digital microscope were also used during the examination. Manuscripts may suffer physical damage over the years due to some internal and external factors. For this reason, on the work under review; technical, material and dyestuff analyzes were performed and codicological examination was carried out. Thus, solution suggestions have been

developed for the problems that have arisen on the work over the years. In analyses; the PH level of the work was determined by PH analysis, the elemental composition of the inks and paper was determined by portable X-ray fluorescence, and the pigment composition of the ink was determined by Raman analysis. In addition, invisible distortions were detected on the work using a digital microscope. In addition, a Manuscript Documentation Form has been prepared for the work. This form includes the inventory number of the work, the library it belongs to, the collection it belongs to, its name, author, copyist, date of copying, subject, written language, type of writing, text and binding dimensions, number of leaves, Identification of the work, description of the damage, binding characteristics of the manuscript, text characteristics of the manuscript and ornamentation characteristics of the manuscript were recorded. The work was authored during the Early Islamic period and holds immense significance as the sole surviving copy from that era. Analysis of its structural features indicates the need for its enhancement, protection, and preservation to safeguard it for future generations. This examination concludes that the only existing copy of *Kitâbu'l-İlel ve Ma'rifeti'r Ricâl*, a book of hadith, possesses qualities that make it suitable for improved preservation and continued valuable use by scholars interested in the science of hadith.

In the study by İpek and Bostan (2024, pp.130-160), they first discuss the general literature of previous works on manuscripts. Then, they delve into non-textual operations that can be performed on manuscripts, such as elements and techniques of decoration. They also cover different topics such as the subject of kudat and, when necessary, codicology. In this sense, the framework outlined by Ünver, which includes kudat but is closer to the more comprehensive concept of paratext, is acquired through the concept of envelope. However, it's important to note that the relevant terms are used interchangeably in the literature. The definition of the concept of paratext, which also includes non-textual elements, in the field of codicology for Islamic manuscripts and its use under this name can technically be initiated with the article written by Ronit Ricci on Java manuscripts. It is also thought that the preparation of the manuscript catalog in Ünver's work is a means of making sense of Ottoman history and culture and developing the primary source basin. Although Ünver used appropriation records as a source, such as in his work *Fatih Complex and Zamani İlim Hayati*, he is often far from presenting a systematic structure in his works. As a matter of fact, the purpose of this article consists of collecting and systematizing the scattered views under different articles in the work in question. Along with all these, Ünver's place and priority within the literature cited in the article make the Manuscript Book Guide important and valuable.

With the latest published 11th Presidential Decree (Official Gazette 16/7/2018 - 30480, 2018), T.C. The General Directorate of State Archives was closed, instead of this institution, which transferred its powers to the Presidency of the Republic of Turkey Directorate of State Archives (DAB) was established. This breakthrough is an important and necessary change in terms of archiving. Positive developments in this regard; it points to a very valuable situation in terms of showing that an Archive Law that will be transparent, rapid, and effective can be put forward in the future. All the studies to be carried out for the improvement of the services provided directly by the DAB or with the support of this institution will be important and necessary steps for the development of the archival profession. Maintaining the archival profession as a more professional one in our country will also be able to encourage the increase in the value of manuscripts and rare works and the conduct of more technical/academic studies in this field. Despite the fact that all these positive developments have taken place in the field of archiving; manuscripts are still proficiency, content management, subject titles etc. it has some missing subject titles, etc. in terms of angles. These deficiencies prevent the full understanding of the content information of many works, as well as delay the understanding of other works that can be developed

based on these works. Unfortunately, the number of works that can guide manuscripts and contribute to their areas of expertise to be more original and understandable is not enough. Turkish literature and reference sources are quite limited in terms of demonstrating the competence of manuscripts within the framework of international standards and unique values.

Especially considering the rich content and diversity of manuscripts, the fact that a detailed subject list/index, author and title index have not yet been created reveals that we should urgently approach studies in this field from a scientific point of view (Rukancı, 2018, p. 3).

In this context, the basic assumption of this article is that a special strategic methods should be used in the characterization of manuscripts. For this purpose, the study focused on how the contents of manuscripts can be determined with the 'science of codicology' which can be accepted as a special manuscript description science and by which methods the works of which content features are revealed can be presented to users. As a result of the study, suggestions were put forward for the development of manuscripts with the contribution of the science of codicology.

3. Methodology

The conceptual framework that constitutes the main field of the study is to identify and analyze academic and applied studies on the application of codicology in manuscripts, and to determine what can be done today in technical and academic terms based on previous publications.

For this purpose, the 'theoretical method' was used in the study process. After determining the subject of the study, research outputs and different data related to the study were created by reading scientific articles obtained by scanning national and international literature and resources specific to the subject. Then, the current symposiums, meetings and interviews held on manuscripts and codicology were examined and the results of these examinations were interpreted in detail. In accordance with the comments made, research results and recommendations have been put forward with the aim of guiding all future academic studies on codicology. The general methodological basis of the study is based on all these elements.

4. Past, Current and Future of Codicological Examination of Manuscripts

When the word codicology is first heard, curiosity about what the word means and the content of this science comes to the fore. Generally, old manuscripts and the personal biographies and hand notes of important authors and/or interested persons written about them come to mind. The city's old second-hand bookstores, which are a common point for many writers interested in manuscripts, also attract attention. It is seen that the writers who grew up near second-hand booksellers learned well the maintenance and repair processes of manuscripts. However, the art of dealing with manuscripts does not end with just repairing the works; authors must also know the source and language features of the works they work on. In order to identify these elements well, many writers try to learn the languages of ancient civilizations; Arabic, Aremian, Persian, Greek, Hebrew, Chinese etc. The paleographer, who is interested in many manuscripts, also takes codicology courses in Europe. Training can be received in the fields of paleography and codicology from Hungarian, Greek, Spanish, British and French restoration experts who constitute the ancient civilizations of Europe and are at an advanced stage in paleography. All the information learned from these experts, who have vast knowledge about Ancient Rome, Ancient Greece, and Ancient Egypt, actually makes valuable contributions to manuscript science.

It is also seen that codicology studies actually have a deep knowledge of ancient languages and the historical past.

Mr. Bardakçı makes the following comment in a newspaper column regarding the current applications of the science of codicology. Codicology, which we know only from experts, means codicology in English; in French, *codicologie* means manuscript science. Those who deal with the essentials of works (original) in written form are called codicologists. In codicology, the text coming from the owner's hand is considered the most accurate copy. If this copy cannot be obtained, it is the oldest available copy, which ranks second in terms of accuracy and first in terms of antiquity. The order then continues from old to new. This rule can be followed exactly in every field of science, from history to poetry, from physics to politics, and the author's handwriting is given priority in order of accuracy. The issue of different versions of the works has been mentioned before by different authors, but for some reason, the necessary scientific studies with critical studies on this subject have not been conducted (Bardakçı, 2024).

As Bardakçı stated that, it is important to make edition criticism when examining the content of ancient works of unknown origin. 'Edition criticism' is the task of estimating the original version of a work based on its copies. Publishing the text obtained by comparing different copies of written or printed works and pointing out the differences between them is called a critical edition. In particular, some changes made by authors in the copies of manuscripts at different times make this necessary ("Edition Critique", 2024).

In Edition Criticism, all copies of the work are collected and the original text is reached by examining the errors that the authors may have made. If the editor does not know the history of these copies, he begins recording them chronologically. Then, he tries to reach the original text by starting from the most up-to-date copy of the work. Today, this technique is used in most of the manuscripts that do not have originals. For example; The Byzantine Studies Center was established within Boğaziçi University, and edition criticism studies on manuscripts are also followed here. The founding purpose of the center is; to ensure the development of academic knowledge in the field of Byzantine history, culture, art, architectural history and archeology by transferring it to the international environment. For this purpose, joint studies and research are carried out on these subjects with other universities at home and abroad. At the center, editorial criticism methods are also applied to Byzantine works whose originals are controversial. The aim of the center is; to support and encourage the development of Latin, Ancient and Medieval Greek education, and to support the provision of education in subjects such as paleography, numismatics and codicology, as well as these languages in the future ("Byzantine Research Center", 2024).

Today, the Manuscripts Institution Presidency cannot fully fulfill the duties that codicology imposes on itself and should fulfill, regarding the classification and development of manuscripts and controversial issues. In this situation, it is not only the lack of knowledge of the experts in the institution; because the number of librarian-historians interested in this subject is only a handful. The only reason why the perspective on manuscripts is low in our country is that a discipline that we can define as manuscript librarianship has not found the place it deserves in university level librarianship education for approximately 60 years and the necessity of such a discipline is not fully understood in the scientific world (Rukancı, 2018, p. 5).

Actually, thousands of manuscript books written or copied on subjects such as religion, history, literature, health, education, and biography from the 8th century to the beginning of the 20th century; they are carefully preserved as cultural assets in Turkish manuscript libraries or museums, especially in

the Suleymaniye and Topkapi Palace Museum libraries. Subjects of manuscripts; scientific studies on authors and their artistic qualities in the last century have led to the formation of different areas of expertise regarding manuscripts. When the notes written by the owners of the manuscripts, the stamps printed, the bindings of the book, the decorations on the pages, the pictures and the information written by the calligrapher at the end of the book are examined, a kind of life story of that book emerges. However, it is not possible to see the rate of these positive and beautiful developments at the same rate among scientific researchers. Especially in a period when artificial intelligence studies have reached their peak, the number of young researchers who will choose to do research on codicology and manuscripts does not exceed a handful. In order to change this situation urgently, more works on manuscripts should be discussed and subjects such as codicology in manuscripts should be introduced to the younger generation in more detail.

In all these respects, it is important to attach significance to current and future training programs on codicology. For example, in the ‘Codicology Seminar’ held on May 12, 2012, of the History and Philology Department of the School of Applied Higher Education at Paris Sorbonne University, who has been conducting productive research on these subjects for more than 30 years Prof. Dr. Francois Deroche gave important information about manuscript books. Two conferences titled ‘Codicology: Manuscript Research’, which can be considered as the continuation of this conference and held at Sabancı University Sakıp Sabancı Museum on July 15, 2012, are also very important. Many codicologists and participants interested in writing were present and made presentations at these productive conferences. Codicologist Prof. Dr. François is the from Sorbonne University made a presentation and speech at the symposium. Important studies on codicology are mentioned in the speeches given at the conferences, which François Deroche mentions in the relevant links. Deroche provides valuable information on codicology through his own personal experiences.



Figure 2. Symposium on Research on Codicology Manuscript Books (Deroche, 2024)

When we look at the most current codicology studies in our country; manuscript studies and collections in Sarajevo were discussed in the program titled ‘Current Codicology Studies: Sarajevo’, organized by Fatih Sultan Mehmet (FSM) Manuscripts Center on 07.10.2023. Kadir Turgut was the moderator of the program, which was presented by Ahmed Zildzic.

The program started with Kadir Turgut’s introductory speech on codicology and manuscript studies. In the continuation of his speech, Turgut introduced Ahmed Zildzic and drew attention to his work.

During his presentation, Zildzic emphasized that there is a significant amount of manuscripts in Bosnia and Herzegovina. He stated that major manuscript libraries were established here and that the most important of them and the one containing the most resources is the Gazi Hüseyin Bey Library. He stated that the manuscripts in this library are in Arabic, Persian, and Turkish. He stated that some families in Bosnia and Herzegovina have manuscripts inherited from their elders and that the families themselves undertake the protection of these manuscripts. Zildzic continued his speech and stated that a significant amount of manuscripts were burned during the Bosnia and Herzegovina War. Stating that approximately five thousand manuscripts were burned and destroyed in the Oriental Institute, which he cited as an example of this situation, Zildzic stated that in addition to these manuscripts, the documents of the Sarajevo Provincial Archive were also destroyed during the war. Another topic discussed in Zildzic's presentation was the manuscripts in the Gazi Hüseyin Bey Library. Stating that there are approximately twenty thousand volumes of manuscripts in the mentioned library, Zildzic also stated that these works have been cataloged and all of them have been transferred to the digital environment. Zildzic made a useful and eye-opening presentation by showing the innovations and conveniences that studies on manuscripts and codicological studies bring to academic studies (Gürkan, 2024).



Figure 3. Symposium on Current Codicology Studies Sarajevo (Gürkan, 2024)

In order to determine the academic studies that should be done in the future on codicology, some important interviews and symposiums held in the past can be discussed. For this purpose, Prof. Dr. Deroche's presentation in 2012 can be examined in detail.

5. Professor Dr. François Deroche's Presentation on Codicology⁴

On May 12, 2012, Prof. Dr. Deroche organized a very productive talk on codicology in manuscripts at Sabancı University Sakıp Sabancı Museum. The topic he focuses on in this interview is 'Codicology - Research on Manuscripts'. The information in this section was analyzed from the topics that Mr. Deroche mentioned in the relevant interview and was interpreted and conveyed by the author. It is one of the most detailed, comprehensive e-resources that can be accessed directly on the internet as open access and explains the subject of codicology in a beautiful way. By considering this conversation, the result that the article aims to achieve can be achieved more quickly and suggestions for the future can be put forward. It is also hoped that the quality and quantity of such interviews and technical-academic studies will increase in the future.

⁴ The information in the section has been translated from Mr. Deroche's speech at the relevant symposium.

Table 1. Professor Dr. François Deroche's Analysis and Interpretation of Speech

I found it appropriate to choose this area, which is a product of the ecology God has given us over the past centuries. Some of the elements I laid out are the needs we feel about manuscripts as professionals. I guess that by having a productive conversation on this subject, activities can be continued for the future. I want you to help me with this. I'm in favor of skipping every detail about paper for now. Follow-up of the topics will be shaped according to your questions. I come back to the subject of naturalness. There is a situation that goes back a long way ecologically. There is a lot of research on art history or all fields, and a bibliography of this research should be presented. The term codicology is a special type of science in itself. The understanding of codicology uses the manuscript form before humanity reached collective memory. Manuscripts are actually like a combination of all the books. In old books from the past, people and children are almost ignored. However, with the emergence of the holy books, this situation began to disappear. Something completely extraordinary has begun here. This situation, which started with the Torah of the Jews, is still clearly seen today. If we talk about the times of parchment or paper, these materials were expensive goods and therefore people couldn't spend much on this field for centuries. For people to buy them, they had to sell as many materials as possible and make as much money as possible. Due to this situation, literacy rates are also very low. There are four types of techniques in the Islamic tradition for classifying manuscript materials. These techniques began with volume-first reading in a roll with vertical columns. Then, whichever one was read was continued by opening and looking at the other. Technical reading continued until the end of the text. There is another way to do this, but such books are not always used for reading. It is seen that the manuscripts produced in the past, primarily equipped with talisman details, are in the book form we know today. Specific details that differ fundamentally are elsewhere. All scrolls arranged in it have certain shape characteristics. The elements mentioned in connection with the rear elements can be used on both sides. Aluminum foils are in the form of single sheets and sheets. The Creator (Allah) scrolls on one side are sewn parallel to each other, based on parchment or paper folded into the codex. This is how Qwaser and later an entire book production are created. Although this type of paper production is of course seen as the content of the codex. In fact, the paper is now created without folding. Only the last two pages of the manuscript remain glued to the back of the paper for a long time. Papers that cannot be kept are famous, as are other codex imitations. In chronicle manuscripts, the manuscripts are strictly in the form of a stack of parchments.

Screening or miniatures should not be used in calligraphy materials. It is our duty to deal with books of all kinds, and mostly with manuscripts. Manuscripts have of course existed for a long time, but the awareness of specificity depends on when the manuscripts appeared. After the emergence of the word printing press, manuscript later began to be used in Western languages. If we talk about manuscripts in the 16th century, they began to appear in a form that didn't fit into the printed book. Nowadays, the issue of what writing is and what it is not is discussed. It is difficult to say that a document is nothing. Material stored in archives is also stored in libraries and can be linked to each other. A different topic can be mentioned here. There are materials written on parchment in North Africa, but it is not actually a sheet of parchment. In fact, the manuscript develops through the study of such materials, another subject of which is the field of research diplomacy. Of course, this practice can also be applied to world manuscripts because it involves hand-written writing or material. Talking about something written means that it was written by hand. The manuscript is a collection of specified pages. In fact, this material is a collection of more documents or short texts. Usually when we talk about manuscripts, we're talking more about the panel script. We witness that books produced for use are reproduced by many people and continue for a long time.

There have been manuscripts written in Indonesia since the 14th century. The North Oh texts themselves are a manuscript. These works are a wealth of information that is not intended to be turned into a book. Over time unfortunately, all copies have disappeared and only copies are known. One of the differences between this project and previous book projects is that something has content to be repeated as is. In this respect, it is beneficial to have access to all copies of the manuscript so that it can be included among the cultural heritage products. In the field of Western manuscripts of the early 17th century, a paleography similar to that of Islamic manuscripts is not encountered. Of course, there are some initiatives. There is possession not only of paleographic but also of a typical information title or Greek manuscripts. To tell the truth, when we look at some artificial materials, we see a different scenario. Because at the beginning of a new research field, answers to quadruple ecology are at the forefront in order to look at both. Of course, archeology can be the basis for what was once here. It is useful to look at materials such as archaeologists. Looking closely at the material doesn't mean answering questions by looking for the items between the pages of the book, it is important to look at the manuscripts at the same time. In the 1950's, material collection was important for understanding European manuscripts. In the Islamic world, book history has been considered as a subject that only exists until today. Historically important in terms of printed books, Western European or Islamic manuscripts have been only recommendations. People attach great importance to a small amount of books. Libraries are not in a more interesting situation. If the manuscripts are viewed from different angles, very different information can be obtained. A large part of the manuscripts are the heritage of advanced cultural civilizations. The benefit of

being produced in large numbers over the centuries is that they can provide cultural and sociological benefits to all subsequent generations. While talking about Islamic manuscripts, it is also useful to touch upon the issue of how they can be passed on to future generations. Mr. Derocke is a professional who continues to care for the incredible number of manuscripts available. As a Hebrew codicologist Derocke, is more or less familiar with all the manuscript libraries in the Arabian Peninsula. There are 80,000 and 90,000 Greek manuscripts in libraries around the world where manuscripts are stored. However, knowing all the numbers in the world is still unlikely. Knowing this number exactly and defining the works codicologically is beneficial for continuity. When going to a manuscript library in the Arabian Peninsula, the continuity of codicology is possible if there is continuity. In manuscripts, codicology and core ecology are very important concepts for printing and cataloging. However, as seen in the observations, unfortunately no one knew exactly how to catalog the materials. When they examined the manuscripts, almost no information could be found that could go into the cataloging departments. Author's name, material history, number of pages, size, etc. he could barely access basic information. However, the wealth of information in these sources actually ensures the continuity of the science of codicology. Codicology is a very valuable branch of science in terms of producing and understanding works well. Unfortunately, the manuscripts of every library in Spain have been burned in past wars and important events. Although some works survived until the 17th century, their number is not fully sufficient. Scholars would want to study Greek manuscripts if they had them. If the Greek manuscripts had not been destroyed in the fires, they would have been in a better condition thanks to this catalogue. As a good tool, codicology can also be used in the observation of manuscripts. It may be difficult to discover the works by looking at them carefully and repeatedly. As stated before, for better archiving it is necessary to have a large number of drafts. Having all drafts available is very important in terms of confirming the content information of the manuscript.

The number of researchers affected by the burning of manuscripts as a result of many brutal wars in history is quite high. Mr. Derocke's colleague, who published his writings in a very good newspaper in Tunisia, has come to a conclusion about the chronic manuscripts that remain in the current state and are kept in intact forms. For example, what is explained in some parts of the Noble text of the Qur'an was of a secret nature. By way of getting out of this situation, it can be assumed that part of the Noble Qur'an is in a secret structure. During the Ottoman period, some important historians and handwriting experts tried to decipher the encrypted roots of the Holy Quran. However, complete success has not been achieved in this regard. Because many parts of the Noble Qur'an are too much individually it doesn't mean anything. Most of the parts need to be handled collectively. Studies on this issue should definitely be continued in the future. Production continues until the deadline in the workshop where manuscripts are edited and some renovation operations are carried out. Nowadays it is normal to have many techniques and these techniques are not very expensive. But it is important to know if there is a way that will not damage the artifacts. It is important to know and be able to determine the application purposes of a resource or other resources related to it. For example, it can be seen that the C14 technique currently requires very few materials. 30 years ago you needed half a page, today you don't need half a page for a draft. Even historians working today can allow librarians to perform analyses on manuscripts. Even a thin strip of paper or parchment can often be enough to do this analysis. Some of the analyses made are very useful even in solving questions of Central Asian origin. Finally, the main purpose of implementing the activities of codicology in manuscripts is to reveal the most efficient bibliography of the manuscript. In addition, the content of the manuscript that will reveal the catalog can also be improved over time.

As it can be understood from Mr. Derocke's speech, manuscript works are not only texts in which ancient information and ancient historical events are written and current problems of that day are described. At the same time, it is one of the most important points reached by the intellectual accumulation of the civilization of a country. Many people and institutions are signing technical-academic studies in order to protect and protect this formation and to deliver it to future generations; as well as to provide it fully to the service of society in the most correct way. In this sense, Mr. Derocke stands out both with his works and with the lectures, seminars and conferences he has presented in different activities around the world. As Derocke pointed out, every study of manuscripts can also lead to the discovery of a new world. In all these respects, the continuity of studies on manuscripts should be encouraged at all times.

6. Discussion, Conclusion, and Recommendations

It is important to determine the personal characteristics of the people and authors of works who wrote and/or wrote many materials from past ages, especially manuscripts. For this purpose, the science of codicology can be used. The application of codicology science and the use of carbon tests are important

in revealing the origin dates of artifacts. For the science of handwriting to develop in Turkey, a law suitable for manuscripts must first be put forward. Later, the science of codicology should be used to catalog manuscripts.

A manuscript law should be enacted urgently in Turkey. To draft this law and put it into practice immediately; in Turkey, knowledge should be created with the manuscript community and personnel specialized in manuscripts should be trained. In order to carry out these operations quickly and efficiently, there is a connection between history, geography, paleography, language departments and Information-Document Management departments.

Document Management protocols should be made. Archivist-librarians who are experts in manuscripts should be trained in the Information and Information Management departments. 'Manuscript Expert', 'Codicologist' etc. postgraduate programs should be established to grant different titles.

In addition, the following suggestions should be implemented urgently in order to develop the science of codicology:

- Received undergraduate/graduate education in the Department of Information and Records Management in institutions affiliated with the T.R. Ministry of Culture (library, archive, information center, supreme board, etc.); particular attention should be paid to appointing personnel who have taken specialization courses in codicology. Particularly, responsible managers who are Information and Document Management graduates and have received codicology training should be appointed to the Manuscript libraries (17 grains) operating in our country. It is important to ensure continuity by ensuring that the personnel who retire over time are replaced by people with the same qualifications.
- Importance should be given to cooperation in projects related to manuscripts to be carried out jointly by the T.R. Presidency of State Archives, the National Library and the Turkish Manuscripts Association. As a result of all joint projects, 'preparation of a co-author directory, a catalog of co-authored works and a list of subject headings' should be ensured.
- It is very important that the 'Collective Catalogs of Manuscripts' and the 'Dictionary of Terms in Manuscripts' are updated and completed in accordance with international standards.
- Librarians specializing in manuscripts need to collaborate with other experts (language, art history, literature, etc.).
- It is important for people/institutions who hold manuscripts to be knowledgeable and have common sense about the corruption of manuscripts. In a negative situation, any deterioration detected in the work should be reported to the Manuscripts Institution, Book Hospitality and Archive Department Restoration Unit. Studies should be saved from negative situations by getting help from this institution.
- Many publications and research on codicology have been made in the international literature since the 20th century. However, this subject has not received much attention in our country and as a result, the number of studies on this subject has remained quite limited. For this reason, examinations performed using different documentation and diagnostic methods in our country need to be comparatively evaluated and followed. In this context, T.R. Presidency State

Archives, Turkish Manuscripts Association, TUBA - Turkish Academy of Sciences, TÜBİTAK, etc. by institutions; scholarships-incentives, etc. for the development of the science of codicology in manuscripts. Studies should be conducted and manuscript experts who will conduct research on this subject should be encouraged.

References

- Bardakçı, M. (2024, 01 March). *We Know many of Nazım Hikmet's Poems Wrong*. <http://www.haberturk.com/yazarlar/murat-bardakci/213525-nazim-hikmetin-bircoksiirini-yanlis-biliyoruz>
- Bekiroğlu, H. (2019). From Manuscripts to Codicology: An Introduction to Critical Edition. *Cumhuriyet Theology Journal*, 23(2), 855-889, doi: 10.18505/cuid.604789.
- Byzantine Research Center (2024, 3 February). *Installation of the Center*. <http://arkeolojihaber.net/2015/04/28/bogazici-universitesinde-bizans-arastirmalari-merkezi-kuruldu/>
- Codicology and Paleography. (2024, 5 February). <https://www.sosyaldeyince.com/bilgi-kutusu/paleografi-t2247.o.html>
- Del Barco, J. (2017). From the Archaeological turn to 'Codicologie Structurale': The Concept of Codicology and the Material Description of Hebrew Manuscripts. *Jewish Manuscript Cultures*, 3(27). (Berlin/Munich/Boston: De Gruyter, 2017), doi: 10.1515/9783110546422-002.
- Deroche, F. (2024, 15 April). *Symposium on Research on Codicology Manuscript Books*. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wU9MPbfz-kQ>
- Dorofeeva, A. (2019). Visualizing Codicologically and Textually Complex Manuscripts. *Manuscript Studies: A Journal of the Schoenberg Institute for Manuscript Studies*, 4(2), 334-360, doi: 10.1353/mns.2019.0015.
- Edition Critique. (2024, 8 March). <https://www.turkedebiyati.org/edisyon-kritik-nedir/>
- Gürkan, D. (2024, 12 January). *Current Codicology Studies: Sarajevo*. <https://yazmaeserler.fsm.edu.tr/Yazma-Eserler-Uygulama-ve-Arastirma-Merkezi-Konusmalar-Guncel-Kodikoloji-Calismalari--Guncel-Kodikoloji-Calismalari-Saraybosna>
- Haltrich, M., Kapeller, E., Schön, J. A. (2017, 19 April). Austria: Digital editing of Medieval Manuscripts Resources on Presentation Skills, Project and Time Management. *Digital editing of Medieval manuscripts: Intellectual output week 1*. https://projects.history.qmul.ac.uk/emotions/wp-content/uploads/sites/6/2017/09/Digital-Editing-of-Medieval-Manuscripts_08.08.2017.pdf
- Handbook of Oriental Studies, Handbuch der Orientalistik Section One, The Near and Middle East. (2019). *Among Digitized Manuscripts: Philology, Codicology, Paleography in a Digital World*. Maribel Fierro, M. Şükrü Hanioğlu, Renata Holod, Florian Schwarz (Edited). Boston: Brill, doi: [10.5281/zenodo.3371200](https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.3371200).
- İpek, N., Bostan, S. (2024). Significance of Paratext: Suheyl Unver's Manuscript Book Guide and his Suggestions on Cataloging Islamic Manuscripts, *Kadim*, 7, 129-156, doi: 10.54462/kadim.1256661.
- Karomani, K., et al. (2022). How Codicology can Reveal the Religion Mysteries Surrounding a Literary Work. *HTS Theologiese Studies/ Theological Studies*, 78(4), o.a. 76-82, doi: 10.4102/hts.v78i4.7662.
- Kut, G. (1999). Manuscripts and Turkey Collective Catalog Studies. Özlem Bayram, Erhan Erkan, Erol Yılmaz (pleasure). *Turkish Librarianship Towards the 21st Century, in Proceedings of the 35th Library Week (pp. 78-85)*. Ankara: Turkish Librarians Association.
- Manuscript Example (2024, 3 April). <https://www.ensonhaber.com/yasam/ivicreli-musulman-arastirmaci-istanbulda-el-yazmalarini-inceliyor>
- Mason, E. (1971). The Great Gas Bubble Prick't; or, Computers Revealed-by a Gentleman of Quality. *College and Research Libraries*, 32(3), 183-196, doi: 10.5860/crl_32_03_183.
- Miroshnikov, I. (2022). A New Witness to the Fayyumi Version of First Corinthians (P. Morgan Lib. 265), Part I: Notes on Codicology, Language, Provenance and Date. *New Testament Studies*, 68, 89-104, doi: 10.1017/S002868852100028X.
- Okuyucu, C. (2024, 6 March). My Ideas Regarding Critical Text Study, the Issue of Methodology (usul)

- in Islamic Sciences. Controversial Scientific Specialization Meetings-1,2,3; 15-16 March, 19-20 April, 17-18 May 2008. 442-445. İstanbul: Camlıca Sabahattin Zaim Cultural Center, <http://ktp.isam.org.tr/detayilhmkltz.php?navdil=tr&midno=39772500&Dergivalkod=0355>
- Quick, L. (2020). Scribal Habits and Scholarly Texts: Codicology at Oxyrhynchus and Qumran. *Material Aspects of Reading in Ancient and Medieval Cultures*, 37-54. (Berlin/Munich/Boston: De Gruyter, 2020), doi: 10.1515/9783110639247-004.
- Reitz, J. M. (2024, 12 February). *ODLIS Online Dictionary for Library and Information Science. California: WCSU Libraries Unlimited.* <http://www.abc-clio.com/ODLIS/searchODLIS.aspx>
- Rukancı, F. (2015). The Role of Manuscript Experts in the Continuity of Our Cultural Heritage. In *Proceedings of the 8th International Turkish Cultural Congress Cultural Heritage*. İstanbul: Atatürk Research Center.
- Rukancı, F. (2018). Manuscript Librarianship in the Transfer and Promotion of Cultural Heritage to Future Generations. *Erdem*, 74, 99-116, doi: 10.32704/erdem.450104.
- Rukancı, F., Anameriç, H., Tuzcu, K. (2016). *Bibliographic Control of Manuscripts*. İstanbul: Hiperlink Edition.
- Tozun, H., Gedik, R. (2023). Süleymaniye Library, Ayasofya Collection of the Scripture Workbu'l-ilel and Ma'rifeti'r Ricâl Codicological Analysis. *Journal of Humanities and Tourism Research*, 13(3), 536-556, doi: 10.14230/johut1505.
- Uhlir, Z. (2009). Digital Codicology and Contextual Editing of Medieval Manuscripts. *Revista Arhivelor*, 86(2), 36-54.